



Career development in organisations: What works and what doesn't

Geoff Plimmer PhD

gplimmer@futureselves.co.nz



Overview

- Career development in organisations is (arguably) in a cul de sac – needs to look outside its field
- If a performance orientation is taken, the business case for participation/high road/relational issues is now very strong
- Common themes across human relations performance fields of effectiveness, personalised and goal focus, authenticity, and relationships
- Career practice has a lot to offer as an individualised glue for workplace relationship, decision making and performance issues – now that it has moved beyond deciding what to do



From 'decidedness' to adaptability Savickas (1997)

Planful attitudes, self and environmental exploration, and informed decision-making provide a framework based on developing adaptability:

- "individuals to continually, throughout the life course, look ahead to and anticipate choices and transitions, explore possibilities, and improve fit and develop the self." (Savickas, 1997, p. 254).



Group exercise

- This is to give you a quick summary experience of the FutureSelves approach. On the coloured paper write in the appropriate place some hopes and fears.
- There is also a list of items that you may find relevant – to get you started.
- Then discuss things with the person next to you



Talk or think about:

- Making connections – how do the items go with each other, or not go with each other?
- What are you doing now to achieve those goals?
- What else could you do?



Possible selves

**Cognitive self representations of what we hope, fear
and expect about our future**

Tied to schema and tactics

Effects what we

- **Notice**
- **Remember**
- **Associate things with**
- **Judge**
- **Act**



How useful?

- Training
- Induction
- Feedback and performance management

Think of a boss or employee you had who wasn't any good. What sort of career development might have worked for them?



The business case for high commitment systems is very strong

- Command and control versus commitment (Arthur, 1994)
- People and culture provide competitive advantage (Bresnahan et al., 1999)
- Human relations are essential to be able to use technology (Bailey)

Winning firms: T & D, participation, staff satisfaction



High performance systems

Zacharatos et al 2005

- People are competitive advantage
- Participative decision making
- High quality training
- Sharing info
- Respect
- Commitment in return



Engineering v interpretation

Natural resources > economies of scope and scale >
innovation and judgement

Need to move beyond testing to helping

Selection >

culture/climate >

performance tools are neglected >

Herzenberg, Alic and Wial (1998)

- Ability to elicit, understand and respond to situations



Are interventions effective generally?

- Yes
- .44 general effect size for human relations interventions

Guzzo, R. Jette, R., Katzell, R. (1985). The effects of psychology based intervention programs on worker productivity: A meta analysis. *Personnel Psychology*, 38, 275-291.



Effectiveness of career programmes

- Career interventions work (e.g. Whiston, Sexton & Lasoff, 1998; Oliver & Spokane, 1988).
- Short interventions, using tools, are common and effective (Whiston et al., 1998).
- Counsellor/client relationships are important (Mahoney & Patterson, 1992). Computer plus counselling seems to be most efficient (Whiston).
- Software leads to more specific questions (Kapes, Borman, & Frazier, 1989).
- More satisfaction when personal and career issues are addressed (Nevo, 1990; Kirschner et al., 1994).



Individual outcomes of career interventions

Outcomes are very diffuse: E.g. decidedness, job satisfaction, fewer PG's, self esteem. But they seem to be most effective when they target:

What works?

- Career related skills
- Career decision making self efficacy
- Accuracy of self knowledge (Whiston et al., 1988)



Employee benefits (Noe et al, 2004)

Career management can result in:

- Direction and motivation
- Sense of being valued
- Adaptability: e.g. should a job change be necessary due to mergers, acquisitions, restructuring, or downsizing



Organisational Benefits (Noe et al, 2004)

- To create and sustain a continuous learning environment, develop commitment
- Attract employees with new skills
- Improve effectiveness of training:
 - Motivation, expectation and choice of programs to attend training programs

Good career development in orgs fosters (London, 1995)

- Staff direction, goals and feedback
- Self monitoring (London, 1995)



Management and Motivation (London 1995)

Career motivation has four aspects:

- **Meaningful personalised goals that are realistic, concrete, approach oriented and holistic**
- **Career resilience** – the extent to which employees are able to cope with problems that affect their work
- **Career insight involves:**
 - how much employees know about their interests, skill strengths, and weaknesses
 - the awareness of how these perceptions relate to their career goals
- **Career identity** – the degree to which employees define their personal **values according to their work**



Impact on Career Guidance

Beyond deciding - to:

performance, motivation, wellbeing, relationships

- Self knowledge
- Wider and more dynamic view of self than personality and IQ
- Personalised goals
- Self management and soft skills
- Emotion, family, values, beliefs
- Noticing, thinking, remembering and acting

Know why, know whom, know what



So what works?

- Develop confidence, sense of control,
- Pursue important goals that are personal
- Develop relationships
- Aspirations and individual uniqueness
- Tools X people x limited time (Whiston et al)
- Goal oriented (Locke)
- Awareness raising and information giving
- Feedback and monitoring focussed



So what works?

- Motivational and problem solving
- Workplace related emotion and cognition
- Reality testing
- Opportunity to impart skills



Example

“My name is Jane. I have been asked to get coaching by my CEO. I have a habit of shouting at staff when I get stressed because their work is just not good enough and there is so much to do. A recent climate survey of my team shows I am not trusted and people are reluctant to raise problems with me. I sense they talk about me behind my back a lot. In my last performance review I got criticised for not meeting my goals.”

- As a trainer / career developer / coach how would you address this?



Some ideas that career development applies to

- The psychological contract
- Leadership
- Self management
- Worklife balance



Good career practice needs to

- Be individualised to staff
- And reflect organisational outcomes I.e. performance
- Support existing HR practices
- Solution/future focussed
- Will likely concern relational, emotional and agency and skill issues



How not to do career development in organisations (Kossek et al., 1998)

Sought to develop career self management:

- Developmental feedback seeking
- Job mobility preparedness

3 day workshop based on premises:
professionals in transportation industry

It made things worse. Why?



Kossek et al cont'd

- Not integrated with other HR policies
- “Higher standard” explanation – people judged themselves harder
- Raised expectations that weren’t met – training rhetoric didn’t match workplace reality
- The course about self management was compulsory – so a backlash

What could have been done differently?



People actually want help

- **Should I stay or go?**
- **What are my strengths/skills**
- **How do I solve these relationship difficulties at work/family**
 - Dealing with conflict
 - Self management
 - Relationship management
 - Raising difficult issues
 - Basic supervision skills



Value to HR and career development

- Does the basics – identifies skills, interests, values, aspirations
- Improves motivation by being personalised and future focused
- Raises performance
- Develops capacity for change
- Cuts to the chase quickly and quickly develops a working alliance
- Improves self awareness and planning
- Dialogue for setting strategies and goals

Example : 30 something IT male

Skills and Interests

[+ has past or present experience; - has no experience]

		Likelihood			
		Very Unlikely	Unlikely	Likely	Very likely
Hope/Fear	Very Strong Hope			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Listening + Variety + Juggling tasks + Creativity + Oral comm + Working with people 	
	Strong Hope			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Goal setting + Leading people + Making decisions + Team development + Managing change + Negotiating + Persuading + Motivation + Creative work 	
	Hope			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + How things work + Computer skills + Tech. knowledge + Giving feedback + Planning + Written comms + Teamwork 	
	Fear		+ Working 9-5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Time management + Organising 	
	Strong Fear				
	Very Strong Fear				

Career Options

Career Options

[+ has past or present experience; - has no experience]

Hope/Fear	Likelihood			
	Very Unlikely	Unlikely	Likely	Very likely
Very Strong Hope				
Strong Hope			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Part time + Education etc + Sales and marketing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Self employed + Juggling different jobs
Hope		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Voluntary work + Hospitality etc + Science 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Agriculture etc + Arts, info, rec and s... 	
Fear		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Computing etc - Manufacturing/distri... + Unemployed - Law and order 		
Strong Fear		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Benefit + Office admin/financa 		
Very Strong Fear				

Values and Beliefs

Personal Values and Beliefs

[+ has past or present experience; - has no experience]

Hope/Fear	Likelihood			
	Very Unlikely	Unlikely	Likely	Very likely
Very Strong Hope			+ Happy	- Caring - Respected
Strong Hope			+ Proud + Liked + Open + Hones: + Intelligent + Do things well + Seeing beauty + ...	- Creative - Confident - Loving
Hope				- Approachable
Fear	- In decline + Failure	+ Alone + Depressed - Not very bright + Unmotivated	+ Lazy + Lack confidence	
Strong Fear	+ Average + Set in my ways	+ Dissatisfied + Bored		
Very Strong Fear		+ Mean		



The psychological contract

- “An individual’s belief in mutual obligations between that person and another party, such as an employer” (Rousseau, 1989)

Some types:

- Transactional – short term, economic exchange.
- Transitional – about organisational change – mistrust, uncertainty
- Relational – long term/open ended – loyalty
- Balanced – dynamic and open ended – mutual success and development - performance based





Leadership

Epitropaki & Martin 2004: Implicit leadership theories say

- Research traditionally focussed on leadership effectiveness and leader traits
- Staff perceptions, cognitions, relatively ignored
- Assumes people match leaders against prototypes (good) and antiprototypes (bad)





Dimensions of implicit leadership

Prototypes

- Sensitivity – understanding, sincere, helpful
- Intelligent – Intelligent, knowledgeable, educated, clever
- Dedication – Dedicated, motivated, hardworking
- Dynamism – Dynamic, energetic, strong





Antiprototypes

- Tyranny – Domineering, pushy, manipulative, loud, conceited, selfish
- Masculinity – Male, masculine
- Those in management jobs rate strong energetic/dynamic as more important
- Males rate anti-prototypes higher
- Women rate sensitivity higher





Masculine (M) traits and leader effectiveness

- Positively associated with leader emergence (Kent & Moss 1994)
- Negatively associated with leadership (Gurmann & Long, 1992)
- Both (M & F) related to transformational leadership (Hackman, Furniss, Hills & Patterson, 1992)
- F related to transformational (Offerman, 1997)

M may predict leader emergence, but not necessarily provide developmental and constructive form of leadership



Self management (Noe, 2004)

Getting people to apply what they have learnt under their own steam

- Identify risks and inoculate
- Set goals
- Self reinforce
- Monitor
- Engage others – get support and understanding
- Report back
- What sort of obstacles can self management overcome?
- Time management

Is this career development?





Worklife balance (Odriscoll et al., 2003)

- **Effective:** Better recruitment, retention, productivity less stress
- **Personalised and goal oriented:** Needs to be tailored specifically to needs of individuals e.g. don't assume childcare is the issue
- **Authentic:** Needs to balance responsibilities and obligations, manage psychological contract, change norms rather than just rules, or there is a gap between management rhetoric and supervisory practice
- **Relational:** Help match personal goals with organisational goals





Worklife balance, career development, and OD all require:

Requirements

- Motivation and constructive engagement about issues
- Choice at which level to target the intervention – e.g.individual or group
- Solutions not rumination
- Context and reality check, not labels





OPRA Contact Details

Auckland - 09 358 3233

Wellington - 04 499 2884

Christchurch - 03 379 7377

Email: info@oprargroup.com

web: www.oprargroup.com